

- 1 NDCEL Testimony in Opposition to House Bill No. 1145 on the 10 Commandments in
- 2 Public Schools and State Institutions
- 3 Chairperson and Members of the Committee:
- 4 I appreciate the opportunity to provide testimony in opposition to House Bill No. 1145. This bill
- 5 proposes the mandatory display of the Ten Commandments in each classroom across North
- 6 Dakota's public schools and state educational institutions. While I understand the historical and
- 7 cultural significance that religious texts such as the Ten Commandments may hold for many, this
- 8 bill raises significant constitutional and statutory concerns at both the federal and state levels.

9 1. Constitutional Concerns

- 10 A. Federal Constitution: Establishment Clause (First Amendment) The First Amendment of
- the United States Constitution prohibits the government from enacting laws "respecting an
- establishment of religion." In Stone v. Graham (1980), the U.S. Supreme Court struck down a
- 13 Kentucky statute requiring the posting of the Ten Commandments in public school classrooms.
- Notably, in 2024, a federal court in Louisiana reaffirmed this precedent by striking down a
- similar law, demonstrating that courts continue to interpret the Establishment Clause in cases
- 16 involving religious displays. The Court reasoned that the primary purpose of the display was
- 17 religious and, therefore, violated the Establishment Clause. By requiring the display of a
- distinctly religious text, HB 1145 mirrors the very type of legislative mandate that the Court
- 19 deemed unconstitutional.

28

- 20 The proposed text in HB 1145 is inherently religious, declaring divine authority ("I AM the
- 21 LORD thy God"), which cannot be interpreted as merely historical or moral in a neutral context.
- 22 Public schools, as government institutions, must remain religiously neutral to respect the rights
- 23 and beliefs of all students and families.
- 24 **B. North Dakota Constitution: Article I, Section 3** The North Dakota Constitution mirrors
- 25 federal protections, stating that "no preference shall be given by law to any religious creed or
- 26 mode of worship." By mandating the prominent display of a specific religious doctrine, this bill
- 27 imposes a preference and violates the state's commitment to religious freedom and neutrality.

2. Practical and Educational Considerations

- 29 A. Promotion of Inclusive Learning Environments Public educational institutions are tasked
- 30 with fostering inclusive and welcoming environments for all students, regardless of their faith or
- beliefs. It is important to acknowledge that North Dakota Century Code already provides for



- voluntary religious expression, such as NDCC 15.1-19-03.1, allowing students to engage in
- 2 religious activities in a way that respects individual choice and maintains inclusivity. This bill
- 3 risks alienating students and families who may not adhere to Judeo-Christian teachings. Such
- 4 actions can lead to division and feelings of exclusion, rather than promoting the unity and respect
- 5 that our schools strive to achieve.
- 6 **B. Legal Risks and Potential Litigation** Enacting HB 1145 would likely expose school districts
- 7 and the state to costly litigation. Legal challenges would almost certainly arise, as evidenced by
- 8 prior cases across the country, including the aforementioned 2024 federal ruling in Louisiana that
- 9 struck down a similar Ten Commandments display law as unconstitutional. This recent decision
- again reinforces the legal risks and demonstrates that even modern attempts to mandate religious
- displays have been met with judicial opposition. These legal battles would divert significant
- financial resources and administrative time away from educational priorities. Enacting HB 1145
- would likely expose school districts and the state to costly litigation. Legal challenges would
- almost certainly arise, as evidenced by prior cases across the country. These legal battles would
- divert significant financial resources and administrative time away from educational
- priorities. As North Dakota grows in diversity the likelihood of such lawsuit grows with it.
- 3. Alternatives to Promote Moral and Civic Values The values outlined in the Ten
- 18 Commandments—such as honesty, respect, and responsibility—are fundamental to character
- education. However, there are more constitutionally sound approaches to promoting these values
- 20 within our schools, such as implementing civic education programs, character development
- 21 curricula, and school-wide behavioral expectations that do not associate morality with a
- 22 particular religious tradition.
- 23 **Conclusion** In conclusion, House Bill No. 1145 poses serious constitutional concerns under both
- 24 federal and state law and presents significant risks for North Dakota's educational system. I
- 25 respectfully urge the committee to reconsider the implications of this bill and to prioritize
- 26 approaches that uphold the principles of religious freedom and inclusivity while fostering strong
- 27 moral and civic values in our schools.
- 28 Thank you for your time and consideration. I am happy to answer any questions the committee
- 29 may have.

30