2025 HOUSE TRANSPORTATION
HB 1050

#### 2025 HOUSE STANDING COMMITTEE MINUTES

#### **Transportation Committee**

Room JW327E, State Capitol

HB 1050 1/16/2025

Relating to cooperative agreements between the director and law enforcement agencies regarding license plate readers.

2:35 p.m. Chairman D. Ruby called the meeting to order.

Members Present: Chairman D. Ruby, Vice Chairman Grueneich, Representatives Christianson, Dressler, Finley-DeVille, Frelich, Hendrix, Johnston, Kasper, Koppelman, Maki, Morton, Osowski, Schatz

#### **Discussion Topics:**

- Law Enforcement needs
- NDDOT authority
- Automatic License Plate Recognition (ALPR)
- Case studies regarding the effectiveness of ALPRs
- Information sharing among law enforcement agencies
- Record retention policies
- Reasonable suspicion requirements
- Prevention of ALPR methods
- Infrastructure installation
- Implement safeguards to protect privacy
- US Government over-reach
- 2:35 p.m. Ben Leingang, Chief Agent, ND Bureau of Criminal Investigation, introduced HB 1050 and submitted testimony in favor #29587.
- 3:27 p.m. Matt Linneman, Deputy Director for Engineering, NDDOT, testified and provided testimony in opposition to HB 1050 #29463.
- 3:41 p.m. Mike Blessum testified in opposition and submitted testimony #29367.
- 3:49 p.m. Travis Zablotney testified in opposition.

House Transportation Committee HB 1050 01/16/2025 Page 2

#### Additional written testimony:

Craig Sepich, Director of Strategy, Policy, & Government Affairs, National Insurance Crime Bureau, provided testimony in favor of HB 1150 #28713.

4:02 p.m. Chairman D. Ruby adjourned the meeting.

Janae Pinks, Committee Clerk

1050 ben leingans

# HOUSE TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE JANUARY 16, 2025 TESTIMONY OF BEN LEINGANG OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL HOUSE BILL 1050

Chairman Ruby and Members of the House Transportation Committee:

My name is Ben Leingang, and I am a Chief Agent with the North Dakota Bureau of Criminal Investigation (NDBCI). I am here today to advocate for the passage of a bill for an Act to amend and reenact section 24-02-45 of the North Dakota Century Code. This would allow the North Dakota Department of Transportation (NDDOT) Director to enter into cooperative agreements with city, county, state, federal and tribal law enforcement agencies regarding the use of Automated License Plate Readers (ALPRs). This legislation is crucial for enhancing public safety, strengthening homeland security and improving the efficiency of law enforcement operations in our state while protecting citizens' privacy. What's been handed out to you is an amended version I will now explain to you.

#### Introduction

Starting in 2022, the NDBCI initiated discussions with the North Dakota Department of Transportation (NDDOT), seeking permission to utilize their infrastructure, for Automatic License Plate Reader (ALPR) systems. Initially, the NDDOT supported the project and began to enter into an agreement with NDBCI. However, after their legal department reviewed our agreement, they declined to grant approval in March of 2024. The NDDOT concluded that they lacked the authority to permit another state agency to place equipment on street poles. The NDDOT has similarly rejected requests from other local, state, and federal law enforcement agencies, including the Bismarck Police Department, Fargo Police Department, and the US Border Patrol. In fact, on two separate occasions, the NDDOT has seized the US Border Patrol's mobile ALPR trailers that were situated on NDDOT property to monitor for illegal border crossings. Attorneys and BCI agents in the Attorney General's Office worked diligently with NDDOT over the course of months to draft a bill that would satisfy NDDOT's concerns, with the

understanding that NDDOT would then enter into the necessary agreements with law enforcement to protect North Dakotans. This bill is a result of those efforts and would provide NDDOT certainty regarding their authority to facilitate critical law enforcement and border security needs.

# What is an Automatic License Plate Reader (ALPR) and why are they important for Law Enforcement and Public Safety?

Automated License Plate Readers (ALPRs) are high-speed, computer-controlled camera systems that capture license plate numbers and related information. These systems are typically mounted on street poles, streetlights, highway overpasses, mobile trailers, or police patrol cars. The data recorded by an ALPR system is the same data that would be seen by a pedestrian standing in the location of one of the cameras. Even so, the limited access to the information in the system protects individuals' privacy, as discussed further in my testimony.

ALPR technology has been utilized for decades by law enforcement agencies across the United States, Canada, and worldwide to generate leads and solve cases. In North Dakota, numerous agencies, including the Fargo and Bismarck Police Departments, employ ALPR systems. Agencies that utilize ALPR continuously report that the technology is a critical tool that helps advance their efforts to fulfill law enforcement's ultimate mission of keeping their communities safe.

#### **Key Benefits of LPRs**

- Increased Efficiency: ALPRs can scan hundreds of license plates per minute, far
  exceeding the capabilities of manual checks. This allows officers to quickly identify
  stolen vehicles, vehicles involved in crimes, vehicles associated with missing persons
  (e.g., amber alerts or silver alerts), or those belonging to wanted individuals.
- Real-Time Alerts: When a scanned plate matches a plate on a hot list (e.g., stolen vehicles, vehicles associated with criminal activity), officers receive immediate alerts, enabling rapid response.

- 3. <u>Improved Data Collection:</u> ALPRs collect valuable data that can be used in investigations, such as tracking the movements of a suspect's vehicle or identifying potential witnesses to a crime.
- 4. <u>Crime Deterrence:</u> The presence of ALPR systems can deter criminals who know that their vehicles can be tracked, thus reducing certain types of crimes such as vehicle theft and fraud.
- 5. <u>Resource Optimization:</u> By automating the process of checking license plates, ALPRs allow officers to focus on other important tasks, enhancing overall productivity and effectiveness.

#### **Real-World Success Stories**

- Case Study 1: In fall 2024, investigators used the ALPR system to track a narcotics trafficker's vehicle. The results revealed its journey through the western U.S. to California. Most detections came from fixed highway LPR cameras. Investigators monitored the target's movements in the source city and obtained the target's phone GPS data. This enabled them to intercept the vehicle on its return journey, resulting in two arrests and the seizure of 29 pounds of methamphetamine destined for Bismarck.
- <u>Case Study 2</u>: In fall 2023, the NDHP Interdiction Team stopped a vehicle suspected of transporting illegal drugs. ALPR data confirmed the suspect was linked to traffickers moving thousands of fentanyl pills from Chicago to various North Dakota cities.
- <u>Case Study 3:</u> In 2024, investigators in the Metro Area Narcotics Task Force, which operates in the greater Bismarck-Mandan area, learned that a drug trafficker was traveling to another state to acquire illegal drugs. Using GPS data, they identified license plates passing through a specific intersection via an ALPR camera. One plate, linked to the suspect through rental records, allowed investigators to track its travels across multiple states, providing invaluable information on the suspect and their drug trafficking organization.

As demonstrated, ALPR technology has proven to be a powerful tool to combat criminal activity, generate actionable investigative leads, and help close cases faster.

#### **ACCESS OF INFORMATION**

Law enforcement agencies typically implement policies for the use of ALPRs to ensure the technology is used responsibly and effectively. These policies often include:

- Purpose and Scope: Defining the specific purposes for which ALPR can be used, such
  as locating stolen vehicles, identifying vehicles associated with wanted individuals,
  locating missing persons, or supporting ongoing investigations.
- 2. <u>Data Management:</u> Guidelines on how ALPR data is collected, stored, accessed, and shared. This includes retention periods, data security measures, and protocols for data sharing with other agencies.
- 3. <u>Usage Restrictions</u>: ALPR usage is limited to legitimate law enforcement purposes, prohibiting unauthorized surveillance or data collection. <u>Only authorized law enforcement personnel with a criminal predicate and a case number can access the ALPR system.</u>
- **4.** <u>Privacy Protections:</u> Measures to protect individuals' privacy, such as prohibitions on and technical barriers to the access to and use of ALPR data for non-law enforcement purposes and ensuring data is not retained longer than necessary.
- 5. <u>Training and Accountability:</u> Requirements for training law enforcement personnel on the proper use of ALPR systems and establishing accountability for misuse.

These policies help balance the benefits of ALPR technology in crime prevention and investigation with the need to protect individual privacy and civil liberties.

#### Fiscal Impact

There are no fiscal implications associated with this bill, and therefore, no fiscal note has been applied. The law enforcement agencies in North Dakota that utilize ALPR systems have acquired these systems using their own funds.

#### Exemption

NDBCI is proposing an amendment to exempt ALPR data from open records requests. While most law enforcement agencies classify ALPR data as criminal investigative information, NDAG attorneys believe audit information within the ALPR system may still be accessible as an open record without this specific exemption. Therefore, NDBCI seeks an amendment to exempt all ALPR data and associated information.

#### Conclusion

Allowing the NDDOT Director to enter into agreements with law enforcement regarding the use of ALPRs will greatly enhance our ability to protect and serve the citizens of North Dakota. This legislation is a step forward in leveraging technology to improve public safety and support our law enforcement agencies.

Thank you for your time and consideration. I urge you to support this important legislation.

Sixty-ninth Legislative Assembly of North Dakota

## PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO HOUSE BILL NO. 1050

Introduced by

Transportation Committee

(At the request of the Attorney General)

- 1 A BILL for an Act to amend and reenact section 24-02-45 of the North Dakota Century Code,
- 2 relating to cooperative agreements between the director and law enforcement agencies
- 3 regarding <u>automated</u> license plate readers.

#### 4 BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF NORTH DAKOTA:

5 **SECTION 1. AMENDMENT.** Section 24-02-45 of the North Dakota Century Code is amended and reenacted as follows:

24-02-45. Cooperative agreements with counties or cities.

The director may enter an agreement with a <u>state agency</u>, county, or city for the cooperative or joint administration of an activity that will enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of the state highway system. At the request of a state, county, or city law enforcement agency or a federal agency with responsibilities related to control of the national border, the director shall enter into an agreement with the requesting law enforcement agency, or with the state agency or political subdivision of which the law enforcement agency is a part, for the placement of license plate readers on department-owned or department-operated equipment or infrastructure for law enforcement or border control purposes. The terms of the agreement supersede sections 24-02-36 and 24-02-37 or any other state law governing the use of state, county, or city highway funds.

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

17

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

**SECTION 2. AMENDMENT.** Section 44-04-18.7 of the North Dakota Century Code is amended and reenacted as follows:

1. Active criminal intelligence information and active criminal information are not subject to section 44-04-18 and section 6 of article XI of the Constitution of North Dakota. A criminal justice agency shall maintain a list of all files containing active criminal intelligence and investigative information which have been in existence for more than one year. With respect to Page No.

25.8034.01000

- description, and occupation of arrestee.
- b. Facts concerning the arrest, including the cause of arrest and the name of the arresting officer.
- c. Conviction information, including the name of any person convicted of a criminal offense. Disposition of all warrants, including orders signed by a judge of any court commanding a law enforcement officer to arrest a particular person.
- d. A chronological list of incidents, including initial offense report information showing the offense, date, time, general location, officer, and a brief summary of what occurred.
- e. A crime summary, including a departmental summary of crimes reported and public calls for service by classification, nature, and number.
- f. Radio log, including a chronological listing of the calls dispatched.
- g. General registers, including jail booking information.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

- h. Arrestee photograph, if release will not adversely affect a criminal investigation.
- 3. "Criminal intelligence information" means information with respect to an identifiable person or group of persons collected by a criminal justice agency in an effort to anticipate, prevent, or monitor possible criminal activity. Criminal intelligence information must be considered "active" as long as it is related to intelligence gathering conducted with a reasonable good-faith belief it will lead to detection of ongoing or reasonably anticipated criminal activities. Criminal intelligence information also includes training materials and information obtained by a criminal justice agency regarding prospective criminal activities which impact officer safety until the information is publicly disclosed.
- 4. "Criminal investigative information" means information with respect to an identifiable person or group of persons compiled by a criminal justice agency in the course of conducting a criminal investigation of a specific act or omission, including information derived from laboratory tests. reports of investigators or informants, or any type of surveillance. Criminal investigative information must be considered "active" as long as it is related to an ongoing investigation that is continuing with a reasonable good-faith anticipation of securing an arrest or prosecution in the foreseeable future.

- 5. "Criminal justice agency" means any law enforcement agency or prosecutor. The term also includes any other unit of government charged by law with criminal law enforcement duties or having custody of criminal intelligence or investigative information for the purpose of assisting law enforcement agencies in the conduct of active criminal investigations or prosecutions.
- 6. "Personal information" means a person's medical records or medical information obtained from the medical records; motor vehicle operator's identification number; social security number; any credit, debit, or electronic fund transfer card number; month and date of birth; height; weight; home street address; home telephone number or personal cell phone number; and any financial account numbers.
- 7. A computerized index created by a criminal justice agency of names included in criminal
   files, whether active or inactive, is an exempt record.
- 8. Crime scene images of a victim of a homicide or sex crime or any image of a minor victim of any crime is an exempt record as defined in subsection 5 of section 44-04-17.1.
- 9. An image taken with a body camera or similar device and which is taken in a private place
  is an exempt record.
- 10. An image taken by a coroner, a medical examiner, or coroner or medical examinerpersonnel, using a digital camera or similar device is an exempt record.
- 11. Unless otherwise provided by law, descriptions of crime scene images that include a minor or a minor victim or parts of a record containing such descriptions are exempt.
- 20 12. Images and data that are obtained through the use of an automated license plate
- 21 reader system are exempt records.

1

2

3

4



### Transportation

#### House Bill No. 1050

**House Transportation Committee** 

Room 327E | January 16, 2025, 2:30 pm Matt Linneman, Deputy Director for Engineering

Greetings, Chair and members of the Committee. I'm Matt Linneman, Deputy Director for Engineering for the North Dakota Department of Transportation (NDDOT). I'm here to oppose the bill as presented and to offer for consideration an amendment to House Bill 1050.

We understand the proposed bill will allow the NDDOT to enter into cooperative agreements with law enforcement agencies. These agreements will permit the installation of license plate readers and cameras within the state highway right of way or on state infrastructure for law enforcement purposes. Currently the NDDOT does not have any authority to permit these types of devices for law enforcement purposes.

The purpose of highway right of way is to provide space for the safe movement of people and goods. The right of way is used for the roadway surface, bridges, maintaining drainage, installation of safety devices, snow storage, and providing a clear zone for vehicles that leave the roadway. It also allows for future expansion of highway features.

The NDDOT has a process for permitting infrastructure owned by others within the highway right of way to ensure that it does not interfere with the safe operation of the highway system. However, the NDDOT does not believe that highway right of ways should be used for permanent installations of license plate readers for law enforcement purposes. It will result in additional infrastructure that has a potential to conflict with the primary purposes of the highway right of way. It would also require additional administrative work to review, evaluate, and permit the installation of these devices.

To address these concerns and help clarify the bill, we would offer the following amendments:

- Only include law enforcement agencies with border security responsibilities, as this has national security implications.
- Change the language to "may" versus "shall" in case there are other engineering reasons that won't allow installation in a particular location.

We have provided a suggested amendment to reflect these recommendations.

This concludes my testimony. Thank you.

Chairman Ruby and members of the House Transportation committee. My name is Mike Blessum. I am a Minot resident and sitting alderman on the Minot City Council. I'd like to give you my perspectives on HB1050 and ask you for a do not pass recommendation. These thoughts are mine and are not the official positions of the City of Minot or other council members.

License Plate Reader (LPR) technology came to my attention during the 2025 budget process for the City of Minot. The Minot Police Chief stated his desire to deploy the technology to aid in various law enforcement activities. This was reiterated by a department Captain during a tour of our central dispatch center. My initial concern with the privacy aspects of the technology was increased when I learned that PD investigators could access the data with nothing more than an open case file in their tracking systems. No warrant, no court order, just an investigator opening a case.

I am not a constitutional lawyer, but I believe that there are various constitutional issues with LPR technology.

- The fourth amendment prohibits tracking movements without a warrant or probable cause. Public roads are not inherently private, but tracking movements in this detailed way undermines citizens' reasonable expectation of privacy.
- The first amendment prohibits monitoring that would systematically track individuals attending protests, religious gatherings, or other lawful assemblies. The chilling effect of this type of monitoring on lawful gatherings should worry us all.
- Disproportional implementation of LPR systems could lead to discriminatory practices if the systems are used more often in minority or low income neighborhoods or communities.

From a personal perspective – over the years I have had family members that may have been on the radar of law enforcement for various reasons. I would hate to think that something as simple as a random break in or other crime in our community could be enough grounds for law enforcement to look into the

movements of my family members in case they could somehow be tied to the crime.

Our law enforcement community has many talented investigators that do wonderful work every day. I certainly understand the advantages of this technology to solving crimes, but we have many protections in place throughout the law to make sure that freedom trumps the supposed safety.

My opinion is that LPR technology should be outlawed in the state of North Dakota. If you believe they are necessary, I would urge you to put safeguards in place like many other states have.

I would ask you to return a do not pass recommendation on HB1050 and consider steps to regulate or outlaw their use.

Thank you for your consideration. I would stand for any questions.

Alderman Mike Blessum - Minot City Council

mblessum@min.midco.net

701-818-2000

Sixty-ninth Legislative Assembly of North Dakota

# PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO HOUSE BILL NO. 1050

Introduced by

**Transportation Committee** 

(At the request of the Attorney General)

- 1 A BILL for an Act to amend and reenact section 24-02-45 create and enact section 24-02-45.6 of
- 2 the North Dakota Century Code, relating to cooperative agreements between the director and
- 3 law enforcement federal agencies regarding license plate readers.

#### 4 BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF NORTH DAKOTA:

- 5 SECTION 1. AMENDMENT. Section 24-02-45 of the North Dakota Century Code is
- 6 amended and reenacted as follows:
- 7 24-02-45. Cooperative agreements with counties or cities.
- 8 The director may enter an agreement with a state agency, county, or city for the cooperative
- 9 or joint administration of an activity that will enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of the state
- 10 highway system. At the request of a state, county, or city law enforcement agency or a federal
- 11—agency with responsibilities related to control of the national border, the director shall enter into
- 12 an agreement with the requesting law enforcement agency, or with the state agency or political
- 13 subdivision of which the law enforcement agency is a part, for the placement of license plate
- 14 readers on department-owned or department-operated equipment or infrastructure for law
- 15 enforcement or border control purposes. The terms of the agreement supersede sections
- 16 24-02-36 and 24-02-37 or any other state law governing the use of state, county, or city highway
- 17 funds.
- 18 **SECTION 1.** Section 24-02-45.6 of the North Dakota Century Code is created and enacted as
- 19 follows:
- 20 24-02-45.6 Cooperative agreements for the placement of cameras within highway right
- 21 **of way.**
- 22 At the request of a federal agency with responsibilities related to control of the national border,
- 23 the director may enter into an agreement with the requesting federal agency for the placement
- 24 <u>of license plate readers, within highway right of way, for border control purposes.</u>



January 8, 2025

Chair Dan Ruby and Members of the Committee Committee on Transportation North Dakota House of Representatives

RE: House Bill 1050 – License Plate Readers – Support

Dear Chair Ruby and Members of the Committee:

The National Insurance Crime Bureau (NICB) is a national, century-old, not-for-profit organization supported by approximately 1,200 property and casualty insurance companies, including many who write business in North Dakota. Working hand-in-hand with our member companies and North Dakota law enforcement, we help to detect, prevent, and deter insurance crimes, including vehicle theft. While NICB provides value to our member companies, we also serve a significant public benefit by helping to stem the estimated billions of dollars in economic harm that insurance crime causes to individual policyholders across the country every year.

License Plate Reader (LPR) technology is an invaluable tool in combating all manner of crime, including vehicle theft. The information collected by LPR systems is wholly consistent with Fourth Amendment principles in terms of expectation of privacy in public spaces. Law enforcement uses LPR data to assist in investigating and prosecuting vehicle thefts and other crimes in order to protect the safety of our communities.

Law enforcement agencies and communities across the United States continue to be plagued by record levels of vehicular crime as monthly theft totals nationwide consistently exceeded 80,000 in 2023. According to analysis conducted by NICB, 1,449 vehicles were stolen in North Dakota in 2023.

<u>House Bill 1050</u> provides law enforcement with additional tools to investigate crime and combat vehicle theft. This proposal would go a long way towards helping stem the tide of vehicle crime in North Dakota.

#### Accordingly, we ask for your strong support of House Bill 1050.

We thank you for scheduling a hearing and for considering our views as you deliberate the merits of the bill. If you have any questions or need additional information, please contact me at csepich@nicb.org or (847) 772-7667.

Sincerely,

Craig Sepich Director

Craig Sepich

Office of Strategy, Policy, & Government Affairs

National Insurance Crime Bureau

#### 2025 HOUSE STANDING COMMITTEE MINUTES

#### **Transportation Committee**

Room JW327E, State Capitol

HB 1050 1/23/2025

Relating to cooperative agreements between the director and law enforcement agencies regarding license plate readers.

3:59 p.m. Chairman D. Ruby opened the meeting.

Members Present: Chairman D. Ruby, Vice Chairman Grueneich, Representatives Christianson, Dressler, Frelich, Johnston, Hendrix, Kasper, Koppelman, Maki, Morton, Osowski, Schatz Members Absent: Representative Finley-DeVille

#### **Discussion Topics:**

- Serious offenses
- Alert notices
- Cameras to identify threats
- · Prohibition of facial recognition
- Restricted to law enforcement use
- Overreach of law enforcement agencies

4:19 p.m. Chairman D. Ruby suggested for there to be an amendment written up and proposed to clear up any concerns the committee may have.

4:20 p.m. Chairman D. Ruby adjourned the meeting.

Janae Pinks. Committee Clerk

#### 2025 HOUSE STANDING COMMITTEE MINUTES

#### **Transportation Committee**

Room JW327E, State Capitol

HB 1050 1/24/2025

Relating to cooperative agreements between the director and law enforcement agencies regarding license plate readers.

10:44 a.m. Chairman D. Ruby opened the meeting.

Members Present: Chairman D. Ruby, Vice Chairman Grueneich, Representatives Christianson, Dressler, Finley-DeVille, Frelich, Johnston, Hendrix, Kasper, Koppelman, Maki, Morton, Osowski, Schatz

#### **Discussion Topics:**

- Safeguards
- Law enforcement overreach

10:45 a.m. Representative Frelich moved a Do Not Pass.

10:45 a.m. Representative Schatz seconded the motion.

| Representatives                    | Vote |
|------------------------------------|------|
| Representative Dan Ruby            | Υ    |
| Representative Jim Grueneich       | Υ    |
| Representative Nels Christianson   | Υ    |
| Representative Ty Dressler         | Υ    |
| Representative Lisa Finley-DeVille | Υ    |
| Representative Kathy Frelich       | Υ    |
| Representative Jared Hendrix       | Υ    |
| Representative Daniel Johnston     | Υ    |
| Representative Jim Kasper          | Υ    |
| Representative Ben Koppelman       | Υ    |
| Representative Roger A. Maki       | Υ    |
| Representative Desiree Morton      | Υ    |
| Representative Doug Osowski        | Y    |
| Representative Mike Schatz         | Υ    |

10:49 a.m. Motion passed 14-0-0.

10:49 a.m. Representative Frelich will carry the bill.

10:49 a.m. Chairman D. Ruby closed the meeting.

Janae Pinks, Committee Clerk

#### REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE HB 1050 (25.8034.01000)

Module ID: h\_stcomrep\_12\_011

Carrier: Frelich

**Transportation Committee (Rep. D. Ruby, Chairman)** recommends **DO NOT PASS** (14 YEAS, 0 NAYS, 0 ABSENT AND NOT VOTING). HB 1050 was placed on the Eleventh order on the calendar.